

COLORADO CULTURAL RESOURCE SURVEY

Official Eligibility Determination  
(OAH P use only)

OAH P1403  
Rev. 9/98

Architectural Inventory Form

Page 1 of 9

- Date \_\_\_\_\_ Initials \_\_\_\_\_
- Determined Eligible – National Register
- Determined Not Eligible – National Register
- Determined Eligible – State Register
- Determine Not Eligible – State Register
- Need Data
- Contributes to eligible National Register District
- Noncontributing to eligible National Register District

I. IDENTIFICATION

- 1. Resource number: **5SM.1758**
- 2. Temporary resource number: **N/A**
- 3. County: **San Miguel**
- 4. City: **Telluride**
- 5. Historic Building Name: **McCoy House, Waggoner House**
- 6. Current Building Name: **Shuteran House**
- 7. Building Address: **235 N. Pine Street**
- 8. Owner Name and Address: **Sharon E. Shuteran  
P. O. Box 748  
Telluride, CO 814350748**

Parcel number(s):	<b>456536415026</b>



THLD RATING:

Contributing to District

## Architectural Inventory Form

Page 2 of 9

### II. GEOGRAPHIC INFORMATION

9. P.M.: **New Mexico** Township: **43N** Range: **9W**  
**NW ¼ of SE ¼ of SW ¼ of SE ¼ of Section 036**
10. UTM reference (Datum: NAD27)  
 Zone: **13** **253078 mE** **4202532 mN**
11. USGS quad name: **Telluride, Colorado**  
 Year: **1955** Map scale: **7.5'**
12. Lot(s): **Lot B, Block 24**  
 Addition: **Telluride Original Townsite** Year of addition: **1883**
13. Boundary description and justification:  
**This legally defined parcel encompasses, but does not exceed, the land historically associated with this property.**  
 Metes and bounds?: Describe:

### III. ARCHITECTURAL DESCRIPTION

14. Building plan (footprint, shape): **Rectangular Plan**
15. Dimensions in feet: **3375 square feet**
16. Number of stories: **1½**
17. Primary external wall material(s): **Wood / Horizontal Siding**
18. Roof configuration: **Gabled Roof / Front Gabled Roof**
19. Primary external roof material: **Wood Roof / Shingle Roof**
20. Special features: **Porch, Decorative Shingles, Dormer, Chimneys, Stained Glass**
21. General architectural description:  
**This 1½-story wood frame residence is supported by an unpainted coursed sandstone foundation, while its exterior walls are clad with painted beige horizontal wood siding with painted white 1" by 4' corner boards. A painted white 1x board with a water table separates the foundation from the siding. Decorative wood shingles, and pierced ornate gable ornaments appear in the upper gable ends on the east, west, and south elevations. The facade's upper gable end, which faces Pine Street on the east elevation, also displays delicate pierced vergeboard. The roof is a steeply-pitched front gable, with an intersecting gable on the south-facing roof slope. This gable extends to cover a 1½-story projection on the south elevation. The roof is finished with wood shingles, and the eaves are boxed with painted white wood trim. A large gabled dormer, with two 1/1 double-hung sash windows, is on the north-facing roof slope. Two red brick chimneys with corbelled caps are located on the roof ridge. An ornate wood-paneled front door enters the north end of the asymmetrical facade from a full-width open front porch. The front door features stained glass Queen Anne upper sash lights, and a leaded glass transom light, with the house's address "235" etched in the glass. The front porch is approached by four wood steps, and features a tongue-in-groove wood floor, an open wood railing with turned balusters, a decorative frieze with drop pendants, scroll brackets with drop pendants, and a low-pitched hipped roof. The porch's underside is enclosed by a painted cream white wood lattice. A large single-hung sash window overlooks the front porch south of the front door. Windows elsewhere are primarily single and paired 1/1 double-hung sash with painted white wood**

## Architectural Inventory Form

Page 3 of 9

frames and painted white wood surrounds. A wood-paneled door, with one upper sash light and a transom light, enters an enclosed, single-story, hipped-roof porch on the west (rear) elevation.

22. Architectural style: **Late Victorian / Queen Anne**

Building type:

23. Landscape or special setting features:

This well-maintained property is located at the southwest corner of N. Pine Street and Galena Avenue. A small front yard and side yards display mature landscaping features including two large fir trees. A low stone and concrete retaining wall parallels the sidewalks along Pine and Galena. The front sidewalk along Pine is elevated approximately two feet above street level, and there is a narrow landscaped strip between the sidewalk and the curb.

24. Associated buildings, features or objects: **N/A**

### IV. ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY

25. Date of construction: Estimate: Actual: **1901**  
 Source of information: **Telluride *Daily Journal*, May 7, 1901, p. 1, May 21, 1901, p. 3, June 7, 1901, p. 3**

26. Architect: **Unknown**  
 Source of information: **N/A**

27. Builder: **J. W. McKie**  
 Source of information: **Telluride *Daily Journal*, May 21, 1901, p. 3**

28. Original owner: **James K. and Sadie E. McCoy**  
 Source of information: **Telluride *Daily Journal*, May 7, 1901, p. 1, May 21, 1901, p. 3, June 7, 1901, p. 3**

29. Construction history:

This property was initially developed prior to 1881. At that time, the fledgling community which would become Telluride was known as Columbia, and it was then located in western Ouray County. (San Miguel County was created in 1883, and the town of Columbia became Telluride in 1887.) As depicted on the 1886, 1890 and 1893 Sanborn Insurance maps, the pre-1881 dwelling was a narrow, rectangular-shaped, two-story building. It was reportedly known as the "Blair House" and in the summer of 1881 it was used as the region's very first school, reportedly taught by Miss Lillian Blair. The building was primarily a residence, however, and by the late 1890s, it was the home of Mrs. Sadie E. Williams. The widow of I. N. Williams, Sadie was the home's sole occupant until September 19, 1900 when she was wed to James K. McCoy. Known as "Colonel McCoy" or by the initials "J. K.", McCoy was among the region's early mining entrepreneurs. He had arrived in the San Miguel Valley in the early 1880s, having previously lived and mined in Clear Creek and Gilpin Counties. J.K. and Sadie McCoy lived in the original house on this property for only a few months, until it was damaged in an early morning fire on May 7, 1901. A Telluride *Daily Journal* article indicated the fire damage was not too substantial. Rather than rebuild it, however, Mr. and Mrs. McCoy elected to build a new house on the property, as reported by the Telluride *Daily Journal* on May 20, 1901: "Col. McCoy has the ruins of his late fire all torn down and as soon as removed from the lots the Colonel will commence the erection of a new and modern home." Mr. and Mrs. McCoy then contracted

## Architectural Inventory Form

Page 4 of 9

---

with J. W. McKie, a Telluride builder, to construct the dwelling which now graces the property. The *Daily Journal* periodically reported on the house's construction during the spring and summer of 1901. On May 21st, the paper reported "J. W. McKie and Son have the contract for erecting Colonel McCoy's new cottage." This item was followed by another brief article on June 7th relating that "the foundation for Col. McCoy's new residence is complete and work on the superstructure is progressing rapidly." The new house, as depicted on subsequent Sanborn maps, was sited slightly north of the where the earlier dwelling had been located on the property. The Sanborn maps also indicate that the intersecting gabled extension on the north elevation was added to the dwelling between 1904 and 1908. The Sanborn maps further indicate that the enclosed rear porch was historically an open porch. A shed (THAS #95) which existed on this property when it was previously surveyed in 1986, was razed in 1988.

30. Original location:  Moved: \_\_\_\_\_ Date of move(s): \_\_\_\_\_

---

### V. HISTORICAL ASSOCIATIONS

31. Original use(s):                    **Domestic / Single Dwelling**  
 32. Intermediate use(s):            **Domestic / Single Dwelling**  
 33. Current use(s):                   **Domestic / Single Dwelling**  
 34. Site type(s):                      **Single Family Residence**

35. Historical background:

This property was initially developed prior to 1881. The fledgling community which would become Telluride was then known as Columbia, located at that time in western Ouray County. (San Miguel County was created in 1883, and the town of Columbia was renamed Telluride in 1887.) As depicted on the 1886, 1890 and 1893 Sanborn Insurance maps, the pre-1881 dwelling was a narrow, rectangular-shaped, two-story building. It was reportedly known as the "Blair House" and in the summer of 1881 it was used as the region's very first school, reportedly taught by Miss Lillian Blair. The building was primarily a residence, however, and by the late 1890s, it was the home of Mrs. Sadie E. Williams. According to the 1900 census, Sadie had been born in Illinois in March of 1863. She was married to I. N. Williams, circa 1881, and was widowed at an unknown subsequent date. In Telluride, Sadie worked as a "lodging housekeeper," also according to the 1900 census. Sadie was the home's sole occupant until September 19, 1900 when she was wed to James K. McCoy. Known as "Colonel McCoy" or by his initials "J. K.", Mr. McCoy was among the region's early mining entrepreneurs. He had arrived in the San Miguel Valley in the early 1880s, having previously lived and mined in Clear Creek and Gilpin Counties. He managed the Gold King Mine and Mill, near Ames, for many years, and was also affiliated with the Tomboy Gold Mines Company during some years. J. K. and Sadie McCoy lived in the original house on this property for only a few months, until it was damaged in an early morning fire on May 7, 1901. A Telluride *Daily Journal* article indicated the fire damage was not too substantial; rather than rebuild the original house, however, Mr. and Mrs. McCoy elected to construct a new house on the property. They then contracted with J. W. McKie, a Telluride builder, to erect the dwelling which now graces the property. Mr. and Mrs. McCoy enjoyed their new home for less than five years. Sadie passed away in a Pueblo hospital, in February 1906, after reportedly suffering from a kidney infection. J. K. died just three months later, in May 1906, after collapsing on a Telluride sidewalk while on his way home from an evening with friends. According to the *Journal* he was approximately seventy years old.

In January 1907, C. D. and Mary Waggoner purchased this house from the McCoy estate. Mr. and Mrs. Waggoner had married in 1902, and had a young son named Charles, born in 1904. The Waggoners would live in this house

## Architectural Inventory Form

Page 5 of 9

until 1929. A native of Illinois, C. D. Waggoner had come to Telluride circa 1896. He gained employment as a bookkeeper for the Bank of Telluride, which had been founded by W. E. Wheeler and others in 1889. Regarded as a model employee, Waggoner rose rapidly through the ranks, succeeding Mr. Wheeler as the bank's cashier in 1907, and also succeeding him as the bank's president in 1919. Waggoner, though, would ultimately be remembered, not for his association with the bank's success, but rather with its failure, which occurred in September, 1939. At that time, Waggoner perpetrated what became known as "The Great Waggoner Swindle." With the bank's assets in dire straits, rather than defaulting on local depositors, Waggoner instead traveled to Denver where he executed a complicated plot to defraud five New York banks out of a total of a half million dollars. After completing a series of fraudulent transactions, Waggoner used the money to pay the bank's debts and to provide temporary funds for reimbursement to depositors. Waggoner then fled Telluride, but was arrested a few weeks later in Wyoming. Waggoner confessed to the crime some years later, as quoted in the *Daily Sentinel* on February 15, 1939:

I knew exactly what I was doing. There is no one to blame but myself. The bottom had dropped out of things in Telluride and a desperate move was necessary. I would rather see the New York banks lose money than the people of Telluride, most of whom had worked all their lives for the savings which were deposited in my bank.

Waggoner was sentenced to a prison term of fifteen years in a federal penitentiary, leaving in Telluride an uncertain legacy; at worst he was an unscrupulous, dishonest, banker who stole a half million dollars, but at best he is remembered as a modern-day Robin Hood who stole from the rich banks of New York to protect the hard earned savings of Telluride's citizens. After serving his prison sentence, Waggoner reportedly later died in Reno, Nevada. The fates of Mary Waggoner, his wife, and Charles Waggoner, their son, are unknown.

36. Sources of information:

Barbour, Elizabeth. *Telluride Images of America*. Charleston, SC, et. al.: Arcadia Publishing, 2006.

Buys, Christian J. *Historic Telluride in Rare Photographs*. Ouray: Western Reflections, Inc., 1998.

Colorado Business Directory listings for Telluride, 1881-1950.

Colorado's Historic Newspaper Collection. <http://www.coloradohistoricnewspapers.org>.

"The Public Schools of San Miguel County." *Telluride Daily Journal*, December 30, 1899, p. 7.

"Col. J. K. McCoy and Mrs. Sadie Williams were married..." *Telluride Daily Journal*, September 24, 1900, p. 4.

"A Little Fire and Lots of Smoke." *Telluride Daily Journal*, May 7, 1901, p. 1.

"Col. McCoy has the ruins of his fire..." *Telluride Daily Journal*, May 20, 1901, p. 3.

"J. W. McKie and Son have the contract for erecting Colonel McCoy's new cottage..." *Telluride Daily Journal*, May 21, 1901, p. 3.

"The foundation for Col. McCoy's new residence is complete..." *Telluride Daily Journal*, June 7, 1901, p. 3.

"The announcement of the death of Mrs. J. K. McCoy..." *Telluride Daily Journal*, February 15, 1906, p. 5.

"Col. J. K. McCoy Dies Suddenly." *Telluride Journal*, May 17, 1906, p. 1.

"Estate of James K. McCoy, Deceased." *Telluride Daily Journal*, June 21, 1906, p. 2.

"C. D. Waggoner, cashier of the Bank of Telluride, is moving into the Colonel McCoy residence on Upper Pine street." *Telluride Daily Journal*, January 30, 1907, p.3.

"33 Successful Years For Bank of Telluride." *Telluride Daily Journal*, May 11, 1922, pp. 1, 2.

"A Historic Bank: The Bank of Telluride." [advertisement] *Telluride Daily Journal*, May 10, 1923, p. 2.

# Architectural Inventory Form

Page 6 of 9

---

"Observing Anniversaries at Bank of Telluride." *Telluride Daily Journal*, May 11, 1923, p. 4.  
 Denver Public Library, Western History and Genealogy, Western History Photos database.  
<http://www.photoswest.org>

Pera, Davine (comp.). *Conversations at 9,000 Feet A Collection of Oral Histories From Telluride, Colorado*. Ouray:  
 Western Reflections Publishing Company, 2000.

"San Miguel County Assessor Data Site." <http://sanmiguel.valuwest.net>

San Miguel County Property Appraisal Record.

Sanborn Insurance maps, August 1886, October 1890, February 1893, December 1899, July 1904, November 1908,  
 October 1922.

Simmons, Laurie and Christine Whitacre. *Historic Building Inventory Record*, May 1986.

Telluride Historical Museum. [www.telluridemuseum.org](http://www.telluridemuseum.org)

Town of Telluride Building Department building permit files.

Town of Telluride Planning Department files.

Trommer, Wahtola. *Telluride's Victorian Vernacular: A Walking Tour*. Telluride: Telluride Historical Museum, 2001.

U. S. Census records.

---

## VI. SIGNIFICANCE

37. Local landmark designation:    Yes            No     Date of designation:  
 Designating authority:
38. Applicable National Register criteria:
- xx** A. Associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad pattern of our history;
- xx** B. Associated with the lives of persons significant in our past;
- xx** C. Embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or represents the work of a master, or that possesses high artistic values, or represents a significant and distinguished entity whose components may lack individual distinction;
- D. Has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in history or prehistory.
- Qualifies under Criteria Considerations A through G (see Manual).
- Does not meet any of the above National Register criteria.

Telluride Standards for Designation:

- 7-505.A.1. The structure is representative of a unique historical social activity of an era
- 7-505.A.2. The structure dominates the neighborhood by virtue of its mass, architecture or location
- 7-505.A.3. The structure was an historically or architecturally important public building
- 7-505.A.4. The structure has a unique historical significance beyond a local level
- 7-505.A.5. The parcel was the site of an important historic event or activity
- xx** 7-505.A.6. The structure has a "contributing or qualified contributing" rating on the THAS

39. Area(s) of significance:    **Architecture**
40. Period of significance:    **1901**
41. Level of significance:    National:                            State:                            Local: **xx**

## Architectural Inventory Form

Page 7 of 9

42. Statement of significance:

**This residence is historically significant for its association with residential development in Telluride dating from the time of its construction in 1901. The property is particularly notable for its association with James K. McCoy and C. D. Waggoner, both of whom made notable contributions to broad patterns of Telluride's history. The house is also architecturally significant because it is among the best local examples of the Queen Anne style of architecture, and because it displays excellent craftsmanship. Notable Queen Anne style details include the asymmetrical plan, the highly-decorative front porch, ornate gable ornaments and vergeboard in the upper gable ends, varied wall surfaces, and corbelled brick chimneys. Displaying a high level of physical integrity, this property is individually eligible for inclusion in the National Register of Historic Places and in the State Register of Historic Properties. It is also a contributing resource within the Telluride National Historic Landmark District.**

43. Assessment of historic physical integrity related to significance:

**This property displays a high standard of physical integrity, relative to the seven aspects of integrity as defined by the National Park Service and the Colorado Historical Society, Office of Archaeology and Historic Preservation - setting, location, design, materials, workmanship, feeling and association. There are no additions and no notable adverse alterations to the historic residence. A sense of time and place remains intact, relative to how this property appeared during the early decades of the twentieth century.**

### VII. NATIONAL REGISTER ELIGIBILITY ASSESSMENT

44. National Register eligibility field assessment: **Individually Eligible**

Local landmark eligibility field assessment: **Eligible / Contributing to District**

45. Is there National Register district potential? Yes  No

Discuss: **This property is located within the Telluride National Historic Landmark District.**

If there is National Register district potential, is this building: Contributing Noncontributing N/A:

46. If the building is in existing National Register district, is it: Contributing  Noncontributing N/A:

### VIII. RECORDING INFORMATION

47. Photograph number(s):	<b>CD #7, Images 228-231</b>	CDs filed at:	<b>Town of Telluride</b>
48. Report title:	<b>Town of Telluride Re-Survey of Historic Structures</b>		<b>Planning and Building Department</b>
49. Date(s):	<b>August 8, 2011</b>		<b>113 West Columbia Avenue</b>
50. Recorder(s):	<b>Carl McWilliams Timothy Wilder</b>		<b>Telluride, CO 81435</b>
51. Organization:	<b>Cultural Resource Historians</b>		
52. Address:	<b>Dogwood Court Fort Collins, CO 80525</b>		
53. Phone number(s):	<b>(970) 493-5270</b>		

# Architectural Inventory Form

## Sketch Map



# Architectural Inventory Form

## Location Map

